

**The Institutional Design of Trade Policy Flexibility
in the World Trading Order
Analysis and New Direction for Reform**

DISSERTATION
der Universität St. Gallen,
Hochschule **für** Wirtschafts-,
Rechts- und Sozialwissenschaften (HSG)
zur Erlangung der Würde eines
Doktors der Wirtschaftswissenschaften

vorgelegt von
Alexander Roitinger
aus
Liechtenstein

Genehmigt auf Antrag der Herren

Prof. Dr. Heinz Hauser
und
Prof. Dr. Jean-Max Baumer

Dissertation Nr. 2915

Difo-Druck GmbH, Bamberg 2004

Contents

	1 Introduction	1
-	1.1 Motivation for the study.....	1
	1.2 Executive summary.....	4
	2 The Concept of Trade Policy Flexibility	9
	2.1 The rationale behind international trade agreements.....	9
	2.2 Flexibility in practice: a first look at the instruments.....	15
	2.2.1 The long list.....	16
	2.2.2 The short list.....	18
';	2.3 Trade policy flexibility in context.....	25
;	2.4 Trade policy flexibility and private rights.....	28
:	3 The Empirics of Flexibility	32
*\$•	3.1 The Safeguard Clause.....	33
V	3.2 Antidumping.....	39
y	3.3 Countervailing duties.....	46
^	3.4 The violation of WTO agreements.....	51
J	3.5 A comparative assessment.....	62
A	4 The Political Economy of Flexibility	63
•?&	4.1 The structure of trade protection in a small country.....	64
.....	4.1.1 The potential advantages of trade intervention for redistributive purposes.....	64
	4.1.2 The structure of protection: a typology of models.....	66

4.1.3	The Grossman-Helpman model.....	70
4.2	Strategic interaction between governments.....	78
4.2.1	The non-co-operative case.....	78
4.2.2	The co-operative case.....	80
4.3	Dynamic aspects of the protection structure.....	81
4.3.1	The enforcement of international trade agreements.....	81
4.3.2	The decrease of permanent protection levels: gradualism.....	86
4.3.3	The temporary rise of protection levels: flexibility.....	87
4.3.3.1	General considerations.....	87
4.3.3.2	The Ethier model.....	90
5	The Current Institutional Design.....	98
5.1	The Safeguard Clause.....	100
5.1.1	Historical background.....	100
5.1.2	Analysis.....	102
5.1.3	Existing suggestions for reform.....	109
5.2	Antidumping.....	110
5.2.1	A brief introduction to the economics of dumping and antidumping.....	110
5.2.2	Historical background.....	111
5.2.3	Analysis.....	114
5.2.4	The main problems with antidumping.....	121
5.2.5	Existing suggestions for reform.....	123
5.3	Countervailing duties.....	125
5.3.1	The economics of subsidies and countervailing duties.....	125
5.3.1.1	Subsidies: fixed world market price.....	126
5.3.1.2	Subsidies: strategic trade policy.....	126
5.3.1.3	Countervailing duties.....	128
5.3.2	' Historical background.....	129
5.3.3	Analysis.....	131
5.3.4	Existing suggestions for reform.....	137
5.4	The violation of WTO agreements.....	138
5.4.1	Historical background and recent problems.....	139

5.4.2	Analysis.....	142
5.4.2.1	Rule-orientation.....	142
5.4.2.2	Two casual observations regarding the dispute settlement.....	146
5.4.2.3	The fairytale of trade wars.....	148
5.4.3	Existing suggestions for reform.....	150
6	A New Direction for Reform.....	155
6.1	A comparative study of flexibility instruments.....	155
6.1.1	Criteria selection.....	155
6.1.1.1	The economists' advice with respect to individual criteria.....	157
6.1.1.2	The importance of prerequisites and compensation.....	159
6.1.1.3	A developing country criterion?.....	163
6.1.2	Locating the relative position of flexibility instruments.....	166
6.1.3	Common denominators of existing suggestions for reform.....	171
6.2	Developing a new institutional design of flexibility.....	176
6.2.1	A simple theoretical framework for the study of trade policy flexibility.....	176
6.2.2	Past attempts to raise the prerequisites.....	181
6.2.3	A principle lack of readiness for reform? The prisoner's dilemma.....	184
6.2.4	An alternative to the rise of prerequisites.....	185
6.2.5	Implementing the alternative solution.....	186
6.2.5.1	Antidumping and countervailing duties with compensation?.....	186
6.2.5.2	The basics of a revised Safeguard Clause.....	187
6.2.5.3	The design of compensation.....	190
6.2.5.4	The text of a revised Safeguard Clause.....	194
6.2.6	The interaction of the revised Safeguard Clause and the violation instrument.....	198
6.2.7	The role of the DSU under the revised Safeguard Clause.....	201
7	Conclusion.....	204
7.1	Final remarks.....	204
7.2	Future research.....	207
8	Appendix.....	211
8.1	Country classification based on Miranda, Torres and Ruiz (1998).....	211
8.2	Section headings of the Harmonised System (HS).....	212

8.3	Evolution of WTO membership.....	214
8.4	Text of the current Safeguard Clause (Article XIX GATT).....	215
	Acronyms.....	217
	Table of Charts.....	218
	Bibliography.....	221
	Curriculum Vitae.....	241

j
j
I