

INFORMATION SYSTEMS RESEARCH

Relevant Theory and Informed Practice

*IFIP TC8/ WG8.2 20TH Year Retrospective: Relevant Theory and Informed Practice—Looking Forward from a 20-Year Perspective on IS Research
July 15-17, 2004, Manchester, United Kingdom*

Edited by

Bonnie Kaplan
Yale University, USA

Duane P. Truex III
*Florida International University, USA
Georgia State University, USA*

David Wastell
University of Manchester, United Kingdom

A. Trevor Wood-Harper
*University of Manchester, United Kingdom
University of South Australia, Australia*

Janice I. DeGross
University of Minnesota, USA

Wi&iM HH HOCHSCHULE
Wi&fi^m LIECHTENSTEIN
Bibliothek



KLUWER ACADEMIC PUBLISHERS
BOSTON / DORDRECHT / LONDON

CONTENTS

Foreword	xi
Preface	xv
Conference Chairs	xix
Associate Editors	xx
Reviewers	xxi
1 Young Turks, Old Guardsmen, and the Conundrum of the Broken Mold: A Progress Report on Twenty Years of Information Systems Research <i>Bonnie Kaplan, Duane P. Truex III, David Wastell, and A. Trevor Wood-Harper</i>	1
Parti: Panoramas	
2 Doctor of Philosophy, Heal Thyself <i>Allen S. Lee</i>	21
3 Information Systems in Organizations and Society: Speculating on the Next 25 Years of Research <i>Steve Sawyer and Kevin Crowston</i>	35
«4 Information Systems Research as Design: Identity, Process, and Narrative <i>Richard J. Boland, Jr., and Kalle Lyytinen</i>	53
Part 2: Reflections on the IS Discipline	
5 Information Systems—A Cyborg Discipline? <i>Magnus Ramage</i>	71
6 Cores and Definitions: Building the Cognitive Legitimacy of the Information Systems Discipline Across the Atlantic <i>Frantz Rowe, Duane P. Truex III, and Lynnette Kvasny</i>	83

7	Truth, Journals, and Politics: The Case of the <i>MIS Quarterly</i> <i>Lucas Introna and Louise Whittaker</i>	103
8	Debatable Advice and Inconsistent Evidence: Methodology in Information Systems Research <i>Matthew R. Jones</i>	121
9	The Crisis of Relevance and the Relevance of Crisis: Renegotiating Critique in Information Systems Scholarship <i>Teresa Mar con, Mike Chiasson, and Abhijit Gopal</i>	143
10	Whatever Happened to Information Systems Ethics? Caught between the Devil and the Deep Blue Sea <i>Frances Bell and A lison A dam</i>	15 9
11	Supporting Engineering of Information Systems in Emergent Organizations <i>Sandeep Purao and Duane P. Truex III</i>	175
 Part 3: Critical Interpretive Studies		
12	The Choice of Critical Information Systems Research <i>Debra Howcroft and Eileen M. Trauth</i>	195
13	The Research Approach and Methodology Used in an Interpretive Study of a Web Information System: Contextualizing Practice <i>Anita Greenhill</i>	213
14	Applying Habermas'Validity Claims as a Standard for Critical Discourse Analysis <i>Wendy Cukier, Robert Bauer, and Catherine Middle ton</i>	233
15	Conducting Critical Research in Information Systems: Can Actor- Network Theory Help? <i>ElaKlecun</i>	259
16	Conducting and Evaluating Critical Interpretive Research: Examining Criteria as a Key Component in Building a Research Tradition <i>Marlei Pozzebon</i>	275
17	Making Contributions from Interpretive Case Studies: Examining Processes of Construction and Use <i>Michael Barrett and Geoff Walsham</i>	293

Part 4: Action Research

- 18 Action Research: Time to Take a Turn?
Briony J. Oates 315
- 19 The Role of Conventional Research Methods in Information Systems
Action Research
Matt Germonprez and Lars Mathiassen 335
- 20 Themes, Iteration, and Recoverability in Action Research
Sue Holwell 353

Part 5: Theoretical Perspectives in IS Research

- 21 The Use of Social Theories in 20 Years of WG 8.2 Empirical Research
Donal Flynn and Peggy Gregory 365
- 22 StructurANTion in Research and Practice: Representing Actor
Networks, Their Structurated Orders and Translations
Laurence Brooks and Chris Atkinson 389
- 23 Socio-Technical Structure: An Experiment in Integrative Theory Building
Jeremy Rose, Rikard Lindgren, and Ola Henfridsson 411
- 24 Exposing Best Practices Through Narrative: The ERP Example
Erica L. Wagner, Robert D. Galliers, and Susan V. Scott 433
- 25 Information Systems Research and Development by Activity Analysis
and Development: Dead Horse or the Next Wave?
*Mikko Korpela, Anja Mursu, Abimbola Soriyan, Anne Erola,
Heidi Hakkinen, and Marika Toivanen* 453
- 26 Making Sense of Technological Frames: Promise, Progress, and
Potential
Elizabeth Davidson and David Pai 473
- 27 Reflection on Development Techniques Using the Psychology
Literature: Over Two Decades of Bias and Conceptual Blocks
Carl Adams and David E. Avison 493

Part 6: Systems Development: Methods, Politics, and Users

- 28 Enterprise System as an Orchestrator of Dynamic Capability Development: A Case Study of the IRAS and TechCo
Chee Wee Tan, Eric T. K. Lim, Shan Ling Pan, and Calvin M. L. Chan 515
- 29 On Transferring a Method into a Usage Situation
Brian Lings and Bjorn Lundell 535
- 30 From Critical Theory into Information Systems Practice: A Case Study of a Payroll-Personnel System
Teresa Waring 555
- 31 Resistance or Deviance: A High-Tech Workplace During the Bursting of the Dot-Com Bubble
Andrea Hoplight Tapia 511
- 32 The Politics of Knowledge in Using GIS for Land Management in India
S. K. Puri and Sundeep Sahay 597
- 33 Systems Development in the Wild: User-Led Exploration and Transformation of Organizing Visions
Margunn Aanestad, Dixi Louise Henriksen, and Jens Kaaber Pors 615,
- 34 Improvisation in Information Systems Development
Jorgen P. Bansler and Erling C. Havn 631

Part 7: Panels and Position Papers

- 35 Twenty Years of Applying Grounded Theory in Information Systems: A Coding Method, Useful Theory Generation Method, or an Orthodox Positivist Method of Data Analysis?
Tony Bryant, Jim Hughes, Michael D. Myers, Eileen Trauth, and Cathy Urquhart 649
- 36 Building Capacity for E-Government: Contradictions and Synergies in the Dialectics of Action Research
David Wastell, Peter Kawalek, Mike Newman, Mike Willetts, and Peter Langmead-Jones 651
- 37 New Insights into Studying Agency and Information Technology
Tony Salvador, Jeremy Rose, Edgar A. Whitley, and Melanie Wilson 653

- 38 Researching and Developing Work Activities in Information Systems: Experiences and the Way Forward
Mikko Korpela, Jonathan P. Allen, Olav Bertelsen, Yvonne Dittrich, Kari Kuutti, Kristina Lauche, and Anja Mursu 655
- 39 Crossing Disciplinary Boundaries: Reflections on Information Systems Research in Health Care and the State of Information Systems
Nicholas Barber, Patricia Flatley Brennan, Mike Chiasson, Tony Cornford, Elizabeth Davidson, Bonnie Kaplan, and Ela Klecuri 657
- 40 The Great Quantitative/Qualitative Debate: The Past, Present, and Future of Positivism and Post-Positivism in Information Systems
Michael D. Myers, Detmar Straub, John Mingers, and Geoff Walsham 659
- 41 Challenges for Participatory Action Research in Industry-Funded Information Systems Projects
Karin Breu, Christopher J. Hemingway, and Joe Peppard 661
- 42 Theory and Action for Emancipation: Elements of a Critical Realist Approach
Melanie Wilson and Anita Greenhill 667
- 43 Non-Dualism and Information Systems Research
Abhijit Jain 675
- 44 Contextual Dependencies and Gender Strategy
Peter M. Bednar 681
- 45 Information Technology and the Good Life
Erik Stolterman and Anna Croon Fors 687
- 46 Embracing Information as Concept and Practice
Robert Stephens 693
- 47 Truth to Tell? Some Observations on the Application of Truth Tests in Published Information Systems Research
Brian Webb 699
- 48 How Stakeholder Analysis can be Mobilized with Actor-Network Theory to identify Actors
A. Pouloudi, R. Gandechea, C. Atkinson, and A. Papazafeiropoulou 705
- 49 Symbolic Processes in ERP Versus Legacy System Usage
Martin M. T. Ng and Michael T. K. Tan 713

50	Dynamics of Use and Supply: An Analytic Lens for Information Systems Research <i>Jennifer Whyte</i>	72
51	Applying Adaptive Structuration Theory to the Study of Context-Aware Applications <i>Carl Magnus Olsson and Nancy L. Russo</i>	73:
	Index of Contributors	74!