

Contents

Late lessons from early warnings: science, precaution, innovation

Summary

Introduction 1

1. THE CHALLENGE OF EARLY WARNING 3

2. THE SCIENCE OF EARLY WARNING 5

3. THE PRECAUTIONARY PRINCIPLE AND EARLY WARNING 7

4. INNOVATION AND EARLY WARNING 9

5. CONCLUSIONS 11

6. REFERENCES 13

7. ANNEXES 15

8. GLOSSARY 17

9. LIST OF FIGURES 19

10. LIST OF TABLES 21

11. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 23

12. LIST OF ACRONYMS 25

13. LIST OF REFERENCES 27

14. LIST OF FIGURES 29

15. LIST OF TABLES 31

16. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 33

17. LIST OF ACRONYMS 35

18. LIST OF REFERENCES 37

19. LIST OF FIGURES 39

20. LIST OF TABLES 41

21. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 43

22. LIST OF ACRONYMS 45

23. LIST OF REFERENCES 47

24. LIST OF FIGURES 49

25. LIST OF TABLES 51

26. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 53

27. LIST OF ACRONYMS 55

28. LIST OF REFERENCES 57

29. LIST OF FIGURES 59

30. LIST OF TABLES 61

31. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 63

32. LIST OF ACRONYMS 65

33. LIST OF REFERENCES 67

34. LIST OF FIGURES 69

35. LIST OF TABLES 71

36. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 73

37. LIST OF ACRONYMS 75

38. LIST OF REFERENCES 77

39. LIST OF FIGURES 79

40. LIST OF TABLES 81

41. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 83

42. LIST OF ACRONYMS 85

43. LIST OF REFERENCES 87

44. LIST OF FIGURES 89

45. LIST OF TABLES 91

46. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 93

47. LIST OF ACRONYMS 95

48. LIST OF REFERENCES 97

49. LIST OF FIGURES 99

50. LIST OF TABLES 101

51. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 103

52. LIST OF ACRONYMS 105

53. LIST OF REFERENCES 107

54. LIST OF FIGURES 109

55. LIST OF TABLES 111

56. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 113

57. LIST OF ACRONYMS 115

58. LIST OF REFERENCES 117

59. LIST OF FIGURES 119

60. LIST OF TABLES 121

61. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 123

62. LIST OF ACRONYMS 125

63. LIST OF REFERENCES 127

64. LIST OF FIGURES 129

65. LIST OF TABLES 131

66. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 133

67. LIST OF ACRONYMS 135

68. LIST OF REFERENCES 137

69. LIST OF FIGURES 139

70. LIST OF TABLES 141

71. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 143

72. LIST OF ACRONYMS 145

73. LIST OF REFERENCES 147

74. LIST OF FIGURES 149

75. LIST OF TABLES 151

76. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 153

77. LIST OF ACRONYMS 155

78. LIST OF REFERENCES 157

79. LIST OF FIGURES 159

80. LIST OF TABLES 161

81. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 163

82. LIST OF ACRONYMS 165

83. LIST OF REFERENCES 167

84. LIST OF FIGURES 169

85. LIST OF TABLES 171

86. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 173

87. LIST OF ACRONYMS 175

88. LIST OF REFERENCES 177

89. LIST OF FIGURES 179

90. LIST OF TABLES 181

91. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 183

92. LIST OF ACRONYMS 185

93. LIST OF REFERENCES 187

94. LIST OF FIGURES 189

95. LIST OF TABLES 191

96. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 193

97. LIST OF ACRONYMS 195

98. LIST OF REFERENCES 197

99. LIST OF FIGURES 199

100. LIST OF TABLES 201

101. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 203

102. LIST OF ACRONYMS 205

103. LIST OF REFERENCES 207

104. LIST OF FIGURES 209

105. LIST OF TABLES 211

106. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 213

107. LIST OF ACRONYMS 215

108. LIST OF REFERENCES 217

109. LIST OF FIGURES 219

110. LIST OF TABLES 221

111. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 223

112. LIST OF ACRONYMS 225

113. LIST OF REFERENCES 227

114. LIST OF FIGURES 229

115. LIST OF TABLES 231

116. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 233

117. LIST OF ACRONYMS 235

118. LIST OF REFERENCES 237

119. LIST OF FIGURES 239

120. LIST OF TABLES 241

121. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 243

122. LIST OF ACRONYMS 245

123. LIST OF REFERENCES 247

124. LIST OF FIGURES 249

125. LIST OF TABLES 251

126. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 253

127. LIST OF ACRONYMS 255

128. LIST OF REFERENCES 257

129. LIST OF FIGURES 259

130. LIST OF TABLES 261

131. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 263

132. LIST OF ACRONYMS 265

133. LIST OF REFERENCES 267

134. LIST OF FIGURES 269

135. LIST OF TABLES 271

136. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 273

137. LIST OF ACRONYMS 275

138. LIST OF REFERENCES 277

139. LIST OF FIGURES 279

140. LIST OF TABLES 281

141. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 283

142. LIST OF ACRONYMS 285

143. LIST OF REFERENCES 287

144. LIST OF FIGURES 289

145. LIST OF TABLES 291

146. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 293

147. LIST OF ACRONYMS 295

148. LIST OF REFERENCES 297

149. LIST OF FIGURES 299

150. LIST OF TABLES 301

151. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 303

152. LIST OF ACRONYMS 305

153. LIST OF REFERENCES 307

154. LIST OF FIGURES 309

155. LIST OF TABLES 311

156. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 313

157. LIST OF ACRONYMS 315

158. LIST OF REFERENCES 317

159. LIST OF FIGURES 319

160. LIST OF TABLES 321

161. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 323

162. LIST OF ACRONYMS 325

163. LIST OF REFERENCES 327

164. LIST OF FIGURES 329

165. LIST OF TABLES 331

166. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 333

167. LIST OF ACRONYMS 335

168. LIST OF REFERENCES 337

169. LIST OF FIGURES 339

170. LIST OF TABLES 341

171. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 343

172. LIST OF ACRONYMS 345

173. LIST OF REFERENCES 347

174. LIST OF FIGURES 349

175. LIST OF TABLES 351

176. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 353

177. LIST OF ACRONYMS 355

178. LIST OF REFERENCES 357

179. LIST OF FIGURES 359

180. LIST OF TABLES 361

181. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 363

182. LIST OF ACRONYMS 365

183. LIST OF REFERENCES 367

184. LIST OF FIGURES 369

185. LIST OF TABLES 371

186. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 373

187. LIST OF ACRONYMS 375

188. LIST OF REFERENCES 377

189. LIST OF FIGURES 379

190. LIST OF TABLES 381

191. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 383

192. LIST OF ACRONYMS 385

193. LIST OF REFERENCES 387

194. LIST OF FIGURES 389

195. LIST OF TABLES 391

196. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 393

197. LIST OF ACRONYMS 395

198. LIST OF REFERENCES 397

199. LIST OF FIGURES 399

200. LIST OF TABLES 401

201. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 403

202. LIST OF ACRONYMS 405

203. LIST OF REFERENCES 407

204. LIST OF FIGURES 409

205. LIST OF TABLES 411

206. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 413

207. LIST OF ACRONYMS 415

208. LIST OF REFERENCES 417

209. LIST OF FIGURES 419

210. LIST OF TABLES 421

211. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 423

212. LIST OF ACRONYMS 425

213. LIST OF REFERENCES 427

214. LIST OF FIGURES 429

215. LIST OF TABLES 431

216. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 433

217. LIST OF ACRONYMS 435

218. LIST OF REFERENCES 437

219. LIST OF FIGURES 439

220. LIST OF TABLES 441

221. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 443

222. LIST OF ACRONYMS 445

223. LIST OF REFERENCES 447

224. LIST OF FIGURES 449

225. LIST OF TABLES 451

226. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 453

227. LIST OF ACRONYMS 455

228. LIST OF REFERENCES 457

229. LIST OF FIGURES 459

230. LIST OF TABLES 461

231. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 463

232. LIST OF ACRONYMS 465

233. LIST OF REFERENCES 467

234. LIST OF FIGURES 469

235. LIST OF TABLES 471

236. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 473

237. LIST OF ACRONYMS 475

238. LIST OF REFERENCES 477

239. LIST OF FIGURES 479

240. LIST OF TABLES 481

241. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 483

242. LIST OF ACRONYMS 485

243. LIST OF REFERENCES 487

244. LIST OF FIGURES 489

245. LIST OF TABLES 491

246. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 493

247. LIST OF ACRONYMS 495

248. LIST OF REFERENCES 497

249. LIST OF FIGURES 499

250. LIST OF TABLES 501

251. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 503

252. LIST OF ACRONYMS 505

253. LIST OF REFERENCES 507

254. LIST OF FIGURES 509

255. LIST OF TABLES 511

256. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 513

257. LIST OF ACRONYMS 515

258. LIST OF REFERENCES 517

259. LIST OF FIGURES 519

260. LIST OF TABLES 521

261. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 523

262. LIST OF ACRONYMS 525

263. LIST OF REFERENCES 527

264. LIST OF FIGURES 529

265. LIST OF TABLES 531

266. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 533

267. LIST OF ACRONYMS 535

268. LIST OF REFERENCES 537

269. LIST OF FIGURES 539

270. LIST OF TABLES 541

271. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 543

272. LIST OF ACRONYMS 545

273. LIST OF REFERENCES 547

274. LIST OF FIGURES 549

275. LIST OF TABLES 551

276. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 553

277. LIST OF ACRONYMS 555

278. LIST OF REFERENCES 557

279. LIST OF FIGURES 559

280. LIST OF TABLES 561

281. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 563

282. LIST OF ACRONYMS 565

283. LIST OF REFERENCES 567

284. LIST OF FIGURES 569

285. LIST OF TABLES 571

286. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 573

287. LIST OF ACRONYMS 575

288. LIST OF REFERENCES 577

289. LIST OF FIGURES 579

290. LIST OF TABLES 581

291. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 583

292. LIST OF ACRONYMS 585

293. LIST OF REFERENCES 587

294. LIST OF FIGURES 589

295. LIST OF TABLES 591

296. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 593

297. LIST OF ACRONYMS 595

298. LIST OF REFERENCES 597

299. LIST OF FIGURES 599

300. LIST OF TABLES 601

301. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 603

302. LIST OF ACRONYMS 605

303. LIST OF REFERENCES 607

304. LIST OF FIGURES 609

305. LIST OF TABLES 611

306. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 613

307. LIST OF ACRONYMS 615

308. LIST OF REFERENCES 617

309. LIST OF FIGURES 619

310. LIST OF TABLES 621

311. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 623

312. LIST OF ACRONYMS 625

313. LIST OF REFERENCES 627

314. LIST OF FIGURES 629

315. LIST OF TABLES 631

316. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 633

317. LIST OF ACRONYMS 635

318. LIST OF REFERENCES 637

319. LIST OF FIGURES 639

320. LIST OF TABLES 641

321. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 643

322. LIST OF ACRONYMS 645

323. LIST OF REFERENCES 647

324. LIST OF FIGURES 649

325. LIST OF TABLES 651

326. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 653

327. LIST OF ACRONYMS 655

328. LIST OF REFERENCES 657

329. LIST OF FIGURES 659

330. LIST OF TABLES 661

331. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 663

332. LIST OF ACRONYMS 665

333. LIST OF REFERENCES 667

334. LIST OF FIGURES 669

335. LIST OF TABLES 671

336. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 673

337. LIST OF ACRONYMS 675

338. LIST OF REFERENCES 677

339. LIST OF FIGURES 679

340. LIST OF TABLES 681

341. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 683

342. LIST OF ACRONYMS 685

343. LIST OF REFERENCES 687

344. LIST OF FIGURES 689

345. LIST OF TABLES 691

346. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 693

347. LIST OF ACRONYMS 695

348. LIST OF REFERENCES 697

349. LIST OF FIGURES 699

350. LIST OF TABLES 701

351. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 703

352. LIST OF ACRONYMS 705

353. LIST OF REFERENCES 707

354. LIST OF FIGURES 709

355. LIST OF TABLES 711

356. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 713

357. LIST OF ACRONYMS 715

358. LIST OF REFERENCES 717

359. LIST OF FIGURES 719

360. LIST OF TABLES 721

361. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 723

362. LIST OF ACRONYMS 725

363. LIST OF REFERENCES 727

364. LIST OF FIGURES 729

365. LIST OF TABLES 731

366. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 733

367. LIST OF ACRONYMS 735

368. LIST OF REFERENCES 737

369. LIST OF FIGURES 739

370. LIST OF TABLES 741

371. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 743

372. LIST OF ACRONYMS 745

373. LIST OF REFERENCES 747

374. LIST OF FIGURES 749

375. LIST OF TABLES 751

376. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 753

377. LIST OF ACRONYMS 755

378. LIST OF REFERENCES 757

379. LIST OF FIGURES 759

380. LIST OF TABLES 761

381. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 763

382. LIST OF ACRONYMS 765

383. LIST OF REFERENCES 767

384. LIST OF FIGURES 769

385. LIST OF TABLES 771

386. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 773

387. LIST OF ACRONYMS 775

388. LIST OF REFERENCES 777

389. LIST OF FIGURES 779

390. LIST OF TABLES 781

391. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 783

392. LIST OF ACRONYMS 785

393. LIST OF REFERENCES 787

394. LIST OF FIGURES 789

395. LIST OF TABLES 791

396. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 793

397. LIST OF ACRONYMS 795

398. LIST OF REFERENCES 797

399. LIST OF FIGURES 799

400. LIST OF TABLES 801

401. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 803

402. LIST OF ACRONYMS 805

403. LIST OF REFERENCES 807

404. LIST OF FIGURES 809

405. LIST OF TABLES 811

406. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 813

407. LIST OF ACRONYMS 815

408. LIST OF REFERENCES 817

409. LIST OF FIGURES 819

410. LIST OF TABLES 821

411. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 823

412. LIST OF ACRONYMS 825

413. LIST OF REFERENCES 827

414. LIST OF FIGURES 829

415. LIST OF TABLES 831

416. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 833

417. LIST OF ACRONYMS 835

418. LIST OF REFERENCES 837

419. LIST OF FIGURES 839

420. LIST OF TABLES 841

421. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 843

422. LIST OF ACRONYMS 845

423. LIST OF REFERENCES 847

424. LIST OF FIGURES 849

425. LIST OF TABLES 851

426. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 853

427. LIST OF ACRONYMS 855

428. LIST OF REFERENCES 857

429. LIST OF FIGURES 859

430. LIST OF TABLES 861

431. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 863

432. LIST OF ACRONYMS 865

433. LIST OF REFERENCES 867

434. LIST OF FIGURES 869

435. LIST OF TABLES 871

436. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 873

437. LIST OF ACRONYMS 875

438. LIST OF REFERENCES 877

439. LIST OF FIGURES 879

440. LIST OF TABLES 881

441. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 883

442. LIST OF ACRONYMS 885

443. LIST OF REFERENCES 887

444. LIST OF FIGURES 889

445. LIST OF TABLES 891

446. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 893

447. LIST OF ACRONYMS 895

448. LIST OF REFERENCES 897

449. LIST OF FIGURES 899

450. LIST OF TABLES 901

451. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 903

452. LIST OF ACRONYMS 905

453. LIST OF REFERENCES 907

454. LIST OF FIGURES 909

455. LIST OF TABLES 911

456. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 913

457. LIST OF ACRONYMS 915

458. LIST OF REFERENCES 917

459. LIST OF FIGURES 919

460. LIST OF TABLES 921

461. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 923

462. LIST OF ACRONYMS 925

463. LIST OF REFERENCES 927

464. LIST OF FIGURES 929

465. LIST OF TABLES 931

466. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 933

467. LIST OF ACRONYMS 935

468. LIST OF REFERENCES 937

469. LIST OF FIGURES 939

470. LIST OF TABLES 941

471. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 943

472. LIST OF ACRONYMS 945

473. LIST OF REFERENCES 947

474. LIST OF FIGURES 949

475. LIST OF TABLES 951

476. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 953

477. LIST OF ACRONYMS 955

478. LIST OF REFERENCES 957

479. LIST OF FIGURES 959

480. LIST OF TABLES 961

481. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 963

482. LIST OF ACRONYMS 965

483. LIST OF REFERENCES 967

484. LIST OF FIGURES 969

485. LIST OF TABLES 971

486. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 973

487. LIST OF ACRONYMS 975

488. LIST OF REFERENCES 977

489. LIST OF FIGURES 979

490. LIST OF TABLES 981

491. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 983

492. LIST OF ACRONYMS 985

493. LIST OF REFERENCES 987

494. LIST OF FIGURES 989

495. LIST OF TABLES 991

496. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 993

497. LIST OF ACRONYMS 995

498. LIST OF REFERENCES 997

499. LIST OF FIGURES 999

500. LIST OF TABLES 1001

Contents

Acknowledgements	5
Preface	6
1 Introduction	9
Part A Lessons from health hazards	
2 The precautionary principle and false alarms – lessons learned	12
<i>Steffen Foss Hansen and Joel A. Tickner</i>	
3 Lead in petrol 'makes the mind give way'	13
<i>Herbert Needleman and David Gee</i>	
4 Too much to swallow: PCE contamination of mains water	14
<i>David Ozonoff</i>	
5 Minamata disease: a challenge for democracy and justice	15
<i>Takashi Yorifuji, Toshihide Tsuda and Masazumi Harada</i>	
6 Beryllium's 'public relations problem'	16
<i>David Michaels and Celeste Monforton</i>	
7 Tobacco industry manipulation of research	17
<i>Lisa A. Bero</i>	
8 Vinyl chloride: a saga of secrecy	18
<i>Morando Soffritti, Jennifer Beth Sass, Barry Castleman and David Gee</i>	
9 The pesticide DBCP and male infertility	19
<i>Eula Bingham and Celeste Monforton</i>	
10 Bisphenol A: contested science, divergent safety evaluations	20
<i>Andreas Gies and Ana M. Soto</i>	
11 DDT: fifty years since <i>Silent Spring</i>	21
<i>Henk Bouwman, Riana Bornman, Henk van den Berg and Henrik Kylin</i>	
Part B Emerging lessons from ecosystems	
12 Booster biocide antifoulants: is history repeating itself?	22
<i>Andrew R. G. Price and James W. Readman</i>	
13 Ethinyl oestradiol in the aquatic environment	23
<i>Susan Jobling and Richard Owen</i>	

14 Climate change: science and the precautionary principle.....	24
<i>Hartmut Grassl and Bert Metz</i>	
15 Floods: lessons about early warning systems	25
<i>Zbigniew W. Kundzewicz</i>	
16 Seed-dressing systemic insecticides and honeybees	26
<i>Laura Maxim and Jeroen van der Sluijs</i>	
17 Ecosystems and managing the dynamics of change.....	27
<i>Jacqueline McGlade and Sybille van den Hove</i>	

Part C Emerging issues

18 Late lessons from Chernobyl, early warnings from Fukushima	28
<i>Paul Dorfman, Aleksandra Fucic and Stephen Thomas</i>	
19 Hungry for innovation: from GM crops to agroecology	29
<i>David Quist, Jack A. Heinemann, Anne I. Myhr, Iulie Aslaksen and Silvio Funtowicz</i>	
20 Invasive alien species: a growing but neglected threat?	30
<i>Sarah Brunel, Eladio Fernández-Galiano, Piero Genovesi, Vernon H. Heywood, Christoph Kueffer and David M. Richardson</i>	
21 Mobile phones and brain tumour risk: early warnings, early actions?.....	31
<i>Lennart Hardell, Michael Carlberg and David Gee</i>	
22 Nanotechnology — early lessons from early warnings	32
<i>Steffen Foss Hansen, Andrew Maynard, Anders Baun, Joel A. Tickner and Diana M. Bowman</i>	

Part D Costs, justice and innovation

23 Understanding and accounting for the costs of inaction	33
<i>Mikael Skou Andersen and David Owain Clubb</i>	
24 Protecting early warners and late victims.....	34
<i>Carl Cranor</i>	
25 Why did business not react with precaution to early warnings?	35
<i>Marc Le Menestrel and Julian Rode</i>	

Part E Implications for science and governance

26 Science for precautionary decision-making	36
<i>Philippe Grandjean</i>	
27 More or less precaution?.....	37
<i>David Gee</i>	
28 In conclusion	38

A full version of the report can be found at:
<http://www.eea.europa.eu/publications/late-lessons-2>