

INFORMATION SYSTEMS RESEARCH

Relevant Theory and Informed Practice

*IFIP TC8/WC8.2 20th Year Retrospective: Relevant Theory and Informed Practice—Looking Forward from a 20-Year Perspective on IS Research
July 15-17, 2004, Manchester, United Kingdom*

Edited by

Bonnie Kaplan
Yale University, USA

Duane P. Truex III
Florida International University, USA
Georgia State University, USA

David Wasted
University of Manchester, United Kingdom

A. Trevor Wood-Harper
University of Manchester, United Kingdom
University of South Australia, Australia

Janice I. DeGross
University of Minnesota, USA

S!!®!! 111 HOCHSCHULE
!*PaaH sal LIECHTENSTEIN
Bibliothek



KLUWER ACADEMIC PUBLISHERS
BOSTON / DORDRECHT / LONDON

CONTENTS

Foreword	xi
Preface	xv
Conference Chairs	xix
Associate Editors	xx
Reviewers	xxi
1 Young Turks,-Old Guardsmen, and the Conundrum of the Broken Mold: A Progress Report on Twenty Years of Information Systems Research <i>Bonnie Kaplan, Duane P. Truex III, David Wastell, and A. Trevor Wood-Harper</i>	1
Part 1: Panoramas	
2 Doctor of Philosophy, Heal Thyself <i>Allen S. Lee</i>	21
3 Information Systems in Organizations and Society: Speculating on the Next 25 Years of Research <i>Steve Sawyer and Kevin Crowston</i>	35
4 Information Systems Research as Design: Identity, Process, and Narrative <i>Richard J. Boland, Jr., and Kalle Lyylinen</i>	53
Part 2: Reflections on the IS Discipline	
5 Information Systems—A Cyborg Discipline? <i>Magnus Ramage</i>	71
6 Cores and Definitions: Building the Cognitive Legitimacy of the Information Systems Discipline Across the Atlantic <i>Frantz Rowe, Duane P. Truex III, and Lynnette Kvasny</i>	83

- 7 Truth, Journals, and Politics: The Case of the *MIS Quarterly*
Lucas Introna and Louise Whittaker 103
- 8 Debatable Advice and Inconsistent Evidence: Methodology in
Information Systems Research
Matthew R. Jones 121
- 9 The Crisis of Relevance and the Relevance of Crisis: Renegotiating
Critique in Information Systems Scholarship
Teresa Marcon, Mike Chiasson, and Abhijit Gopal 143
- 10 Whatever Happened to Information Systems Ethics? Caught between
the Devil and the Deep Blue Sea
Frances Bell and Alison Adam 159
- 11 Supporting Engineering of Information Systems in Emergent
Organizations
Sandeep Purao and Duane P. Truex III 175

Part 3: Critical Interpretive Studies

- 12 The Choice of Critical Information Systems Research
Debra Howcroft and Eileen M. Trauth 195
- 13 The Research Approach and Methodology Used in an Interpretive
Study of a Web Information System: Contextualizing Practice
Anita Greenhill 213
- 14 Applying Habermas' Validity Claims as a Standard for Critical
Discourse Analysis
Wendy Cukier, Robert Bauer, and Catherine Middleton 233
- 15 Conducting Critical Research in Information Systems: Can Actor-
Network Theory Help?
ElaKtecuti 259
- 16 Conducting and Evaluating Critical Interpretive Research: Examining
Criteria as a Key Component in Building a Research Tradition
Marlei Pozzebon 275
- 17 Making Contributions from Interpretive Case Studies: Examining
Processes of Construction and Use
Michael Barrett and Geoff Walsham 293

Part 4: Action Research

- 18 Action Research: Time to Take a Turn?
Briony J. Oates , . 315
- 19 The Role of Conventional Research Methods in Information Systems
Action Research
Matt Germonprez and Lars Mathiassen 335
- 20 Themes, Iteration, and Recoverability in Action Research
SueHolwell 353

Part 5: Theoretical Perspectives in IS Research

- 21 The Use of Social Theories in 20 Years of WG 8.2 Empirical Research
Dona! Flynn and Peggy Gregory . 365
- 22 StructurANTion in Research and Practice: Representing Actor
Networks, Their Structurated Orders and Translations
Laurence Brooks and Chris Atkinson 389
- 23 Socio-Technical Structure: An Experiment in Integrative Theory Building
Jeremy Rose, Rikard Lindgren, and Ola Henfridsson 411
- 24 Exposing Best Practices Through Narrative: The ERP Example
Erica L, Wagner, Robert D. Galliers, and Susan V. Scott 433
- 25 Information Systems Research and Development by Activity Analysis
and Development: Dead Horse or the Next Wave?
*Mikko Korpela. Anja Mursu. Abimbola Soriyan. Anne Erola,
Heidi Hdkkinen, and Marika Toivanen* 453
- 26 Making Sense of Technological Frames: Promise, Progress, and
Potential
Elizabeth Davidson and David Pai 473
- 27 Reflection on Development Techniques Using the Psychology
Literature: Over Two Decades of Bias and Conceptual Blocks
Carl Adams and David E. A vison 493

Part 6: Systems Development: Methods, Politics, and Users

- 28 Enterprise System as an Orchestrator of Dynamic Capability Development: A Case Study of the IRAS and TechCo
Chee Wee Tan, Eric T. K. Lim, Shan Ling Pan, and Calvin M. L. Chan 515
- 29 On Transferring a Method into a Usage Situation
Brian Lings and Bjorn Lundell 535
- 30 From Critical Theory into Information Systems Practice: A Case Study of a Payroll-Personnel System
Teresa Waring 555
- 31 Resistance or Deviance: A High-Tech Workplace During the Bursting of the Dot-Com Bubble
Andrea Hoplight Tapia 577
- 32 The Politics of Knowledge in Using GIS for Land Management in India
S. K. Puri and Sundeep Sahay 597
- 33 Systems Development in the Wild: User-Led Exploration and Transformation of Organizing Visions
Margunn Aanestad, Dixi Louise Henriksen, and Jens Kaaber Pors 615
- 34 Improvisation in Information Systems Development
Jorgen P. Bansler and Erling C. Havn 631

Part 7: Panels and Position Papers

- 35 Twenty Years of Applying Grounded Theory in Information Systems: A Coding Method, Useful Theory Generation Method, or an Orthodox Positivist Method of Data Analysis?
Tony Bryant, Jim Hughes, Michael D. Myers, Eileen Trauth, and Cathy Urquhart 649
- 36 Building Capacity for E-Government: Contradictions and Synergies in the Dialectics of Action Research
David Wastell, Peter Kawalek, Mike Newman, Mike Willetts, and Peter Langmead-Jones 651
- 37 New Insights into Studying Agency and Information Technology
Tony Salvador, Jeremy Rose, Edgar A. Whitley, and Melanie Wilson 653

- 38 Researching and Developing Work Activities in Information Systems:
Experiences and the Way Forward
*Mikko Korpela, Jonathan P. Allen, Olav Bertelsen, Yvonne Dittrich,
Kari Kuutti, Kristina Lauche, and Anja Mursu* 655
- 39 Crossing Disciplinary Boundaries: Reflections on Information Systems
Research in Health Care and the State of Information Systems
*Nicholas Barber, Patricia Flatley Brennan, Mike Chiasson, Tony
Cornford, Elizabeth Davidson, Bonnie Kaplan, and Ela Klecuri* 657
- 40 The Great Quantitative/Qualitative Debate: The Past, Present, and
Future of Positivism and Post-Positivism in Information Systems
Michael D. Myers, Detmar Straub, John Mingers, and Geoff Walsham 659
- 41 Challenges for Participatory Action Research in Industry-Funded
Information Systems Projects
Karin Breu, Christopher J. Hemingway, and Joe Peppard 661
- 42 Theory and Action for Emancipation: Elements of a Critical
Realist Approach
Melanie Wilson and Anita Greenhill 667
- 43 Non-Dualism and Information Systems Research
Abhijit Jain 675
- 44 Contextual Dependencies and Gender Strategy
Peter M. Bednar 681
- 45 Information Technology and the Good Life
Erik Stolterman and Anna Croon Fors 687
- 46 Embracing Information as Concept and Practice
Robert Stephens 693
- 47 Truth to Tell? Some Observations on the Application of Truth
Tests in Published Information Systems Research
Brian Webb 699
- 48 How Stakeholder Analysis can be Mobilized with Actor-Network
Theory to identify Actors
A. Pouloudi, R. Gandecha, C. Atkinson, and A. Papazafeiropoulou 705
- 49 Symbolic Processes in ERP Versus Legacy System Usage
Martin M. T. Ng and Michael T. K. Tan 713

50	.Dynamics of Use and Supply: An Analytic Lens for Information Systems Research <i>Jennifer Whyte</i>	723
51	Applying Adaptive Structuration Theory to the Study of Context-Aware Applications <i>Carl Magnus Olsson and Nancy L. Russo</i> --	735
	Index of Contributors	743