

OFFSHORE FINANCIAL LAW

Trusts and Related Tax Issues

SECOND EDITION

ROSE-MARIE BELLE ANTOINE

LLB (UWI); LLM (Cambridge); D Phil (Oxon)
Professor of Labour Law & Offshore Financial Law
Attorney-at-Law

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CONTENTS

<i>Tables of Cases</i>	xxiii
<i>Tables of National and International Legislation</i>	xliii

I FUNDAMENTALS OF THE OFFSHORE TRUST

1. Introduction—The Place of the Offshore Trust in the Offshore Financial Centre	
A. Introduction	1.01
B. Features of Offshore Centres	1.09
C. The Offshore Trust as a Hybrid Trust	1.13
D. Offshore Trusts Force a Jurisprudential Review of Trusts	1.18
E. Wider Issues Relating to Offshore Financial Centres and Trusts	1.22
F. Suitability of the Trust in International Commerce	1.25
G. Direction of the Work—Comparative Issue Analysis	1.32
H. Relative Uniformity in Offshore Trusts Law	1.33
I. Persuasive Precedents in Similar Offshore Jurisdictions	1.38
2. Anatomy and Functions of the Offshore Trust	
A. Nature of the Offshore Trust as Hybrid Trust	2.01
B. General Features Characteristic of the Offshore Trust	2.12
C. Characteristics of Persons and Offices Associated with the Offshore Trust	2.23
D. Extended Perpetuity and Accumulation Periods	2.36
E. Increased Protection against Creditors and Others Threatening the Assets	2.39
F. Statutory Provisions Aimed at Reconciling Potential Conflicts of Law	2.41
G. Defeating the <i>Saunders v Vautier</i> Rule	2.42
H. Flight Clauses and Duress Clauses which Shield the Offshore Trust	2.50

I. Constituting a Valid Trust	2.58
J. Letter or Memorandum of Wishes *	2.66
3. Special Trust Vehicles	
A. Asset Protection Trusts	3.01
B. The Emergence of the Purpose Trust	3.09
C. Description of Key Provisions on Offshore Purpose Trusts	3.33
D. Creation of the Institution of the Enforcer	3.51
E. Interpreting the Prescribed Statutory Conditions for Establishing Purpose Trusts	3.73
F. Extension of Charitable Trusts	3.82
G. Emergence of Private Trust Companies	3.87
H. Anti-Bartlett or VISTA Trusts	3.93
I. The Shari'a Trust	3.126
4. Onshore Offshore Trusts—The United States Example	
A. Introduction—Emergence of the Offshore Trust Phenomenon in Onshore Jurisdictions	4.01
5. The Role and Powers of the Offshore Protector	
A. Introduction—Rise of the Institution of the Protector	5.01
B. Description of the Protector	5.02
C. The Nature of the Protector's Powers	5.21
D. Case Law Approach to the Protector—Fiduciary or Non-Fiduciary	5.28
E. Accountability of the Protector	5.49
F. Drafting the Trust Instrument to Include a Protector	5.68
G. The Enforcer versus the Protector	5.73
6. Questions of Legitimacy and the Offshore Trust	
A. Introduction	6.01
B. Self-settled Protective Trusts and Public Policy	6.07
C. Justifying the Use of Offshore Trusts	6.13
D. Defending Public Policy Challenges to Offshore Trusts	6.19
E. Attacks on Offshore Financial Regimes	6.24
F. Future Discussions on Validity	6.32

Contents

7. Acceptance of the Offshore Trust

A. Introduction	*	7.01
B. Category of Trust—Hybrid Functions and Their Validity		7.02
C. A True Trust—Recharacterization		"7.04
D. Public Policy and Validity		7.07
E. Evolution of the Trust		7.16

II CHALLENGES TO THE OFFSHORE TRUST AND COMMON PITFALLS TO AVOID

8. Disclosure and Confidentiality Obligations

A. Introduction		8.01
B. Trusts and Confidentiality Norms in Offshore Jurisdictions		8.06
C. Avenues for Disclosure		8.19
D. Rights to Information on the Offshore Trust		8.28
E. Exceptions to Disclosure of Information	. > •	8.71
F. Inherent Discretion for Disclosure— <i>Schmidt v Rosewood Trust Ltd</i>		8.85
G. Secrecy Clauses		8.125
H. Partial Disclosure		8.126
I. Letters of Request and the Trust		8.128
J. Duty to Keep Accounts		8.135

9. The Offshore Trust as a Sham

A. The Essence of a Sham Trust—From Control to Common Intention		9.01
B. Identifying Offshore Trusts as Shams		9.57
C. Neutral Features which May Lead to Sham Findings		9.90
D. Protecting against Sham Attacks—Legislation and Other Initiatives		9.100

10. The Law on Fraudulent Conveyances, Creditors and the Offshore Trust

A. The Relevance of the Law on Fraudulent Conveyances to Offshore Trusts		10.01
B. US Law on Fraudulent Conveyances and Foreign Trusts—Particular Concerns		10.15

Contents

C. Duress, Termination, Flight Clauses, and the Offshore Trust	10.21
D. The Problem of Identifying Appropriate Creditors	10.26
E. Tests to Determine to which Future Creditors the Law Applies	10.36
F. Offshore Legislation on Fraudulent Conveyancing and Related Jurisprudence	10.81
G. Judicial Pronouncements on the Validity of Offshore Provisions on Fraudulent Conveyances	10.102
H. Liability of Professionals	10.128
I. Conclusion	10.133
11. Duties of Trustees in Managing Offshore Trusts	
A. General Duties under the Common Law	11.01
B. Exploring the Prudent Investor Rule	11.22
C. Special Considerations for Trustees	11.42
D. Finding the Equitable Balance in Offshore Trusts *	11.69
E. Abdication and Delegation of Discretion	11.88
F. Responsible Transactions, Anti-Money Laundering, and beyond	11.97
G. Avoiding Liability	11.107
H. Duties of Offshore Trustees where there are Underlying Companies	11.132
12. Liability of Third Parties to the Trust	
A. Development of Third Party Liability in Modern Commerce	12.01
B. Knowing Assistance or Dishonest Assistance	12.19
C. Knowing Receipt	12.37
D. Special Parties and Strangers Who Assist or Receive	12.52
E. Other Avenues for Liability	12.64
13. Trusts and Companies—Directors' Liabilities and Trustee Possibilities	
A. The Trust as a Corporate Entity and the Question of Liability	13-01
B. Direct Liability for Breach of Trust	13-08
C. Methods to Sidestep Limited Liability—Piercing the Corporate Veil	13-20
D. Negligence of Directors	13-36

Contents

E. Third Party Liability of Corporate Trustees	13.41
F. The Demise of Dog Leg Claims »	13.46
G. Duties of Nominee and Non-Executive Directors	13.56
H. Offshore Statutory Position	13.62

III THE OFFSHORE TAX FUNCTION

14. Assessing the Tax Function of Offshore Trusts	
A. Introduction	14.01
B. Harmful Tax Competition versus a Level Playing Field for Tax	14.12
C. Impact of Anti-Money Laundering Laws on Tax Offences	14.22
D. Legitimacy of the Tax Function and Jurisdiction to Tax	14.26
E. Continued Opportunities in Offshore Tax Planning	14.34
F. Tax and Human Rights—Protecting Offshore Trusts?	14.41
G. Attempts to Avoid Liability "	14.59
15. Overview of Statutory Tax Countermeasures against Offshore Trusts	
A. Introduction	15.01
B. Civil Law Assumptions about the Trust in Tax Matters	15.14
C. Tax Countermeasures in the United Kingdom	15-27
D. Tax Countermeasures in the US	15-69
E. Tax Countermeasures in Canada	15.94
F. Statutory Disclosure Initiatives Relating to Tax and Trusts	15.107
16. Judicial Engineering of the Tax Function of Offshore Trusts	
A. Introduction	16.01
B. Interpreting Tax Avoidance	16.03
C. Tax and Sham Trusts	16.39
D. Changed Interpretations of Residence Concept	16.61
E. A Note on Human Rights and Changing Attitudes	16.63
17. The Non-Enforcement of Foreign Fiscal Law—Sustaining the Tax Function of Offshore Trusts	
A. Introduction—Offshore States Follow Rule on Non-Enforcement of Revenue Laws	17.01

Contents

B. Differentiating the Rule from Other Provisions on No n-Enforcement	17-06
C. Application of the Rule against the Non-Enforcement of Fiscal Law	17.17
D. Indirect Enforcement in Substance	17.20
E. Erosion of the Rule on Non-Enforcement of Foreign Tax Law and Comity	17.29
F. Reaffirmation of the Rule on the Non-Enforcement of Foreign Fiscal Law	17.43
G. Upholding Tax Planning Functions	17.47
H. Money Laundering Legislation and the Rule on No n-Enforcement *	17.51
I. Impact of the Rule post OECD Convention	17.52
18. The Emergence of Tax Exchange of Information Agreements and Other Treaty Arrangements	
A. Introduction—Increased Routes to International Legal ^{fc} Assistance and Conflicts in Legal Approaches	18.01
B. Tax Information Exchange Agreements	18.03
C. Double Taxation Treaties	18.109
D. Mutual Legal Assistance Treaties and Tax Matters	18.128
E. Impact of Treaty Requirements on Confidentiality	18.149
19. Duties of Offshore Trustees in Relation to Tax	
A. Introduction	19.01
B. Duty not to Incur Further Tax Liabilities	19.02
C. Effect of the Rule in <i>Hastings-Bass</i> on the Taxation of Trusts	19.10
D. Whether Trustee to Pay Taxes and Honour Settlor and Beneficiary Obligations	19.76
IV THE CONFLICT OF LAWS AND THE OFFSHORE TRUST	
20. Transplanting the Common Law Trust—Conflict of Laws and the Acceptance of the Offshore Trust	
A. Introduction	20.01
B. The Hague Convention on Trusts	20.15

21. Jurisdiction over the Offshore Trust	
A. The Importance of the Jurisdiction Question	21.01
B. Traditional Bases for Jurisdiction	21.06
C. Exclusive Jurisdiction	21.40
D. Rules for Declining Jurisdiction	21.69
E. Offshore Factors Important to Jurisdiction	21.90
22. The Proper Law of the Offshore Trust	
A. Introduction—Uncertainty of Rules on Proper Law	22.01
B. Offshore Provisions—Offshore Law Chosen as Proper Law	22.07
C. Impact of the Hague Convention on the Recognition of Trusts	22.15
D. Peculiarities of Offshore Trusts	22.18
E. Interpretation of Law Most Closely Connected under the Hague Convention on the Recognition of Trusts	22.24
F. Scope of Proper Law	22.41
G. Distinctions between Preliminary Questions and Proper Law on the Interpretation of the Trust and its Validity	22.48
H. Challenges to the Parties' Choice of Law	22.56
I. The Hague Convention's Influence on Express Choice Tested	22.72
J. Choice of Law and Judicial Power to Vary the Terms of the Trust	22.75
K. Change of Proper Law	22.80
23. Recognition of the Offshore Trust in Civil Law Countries	
A. Introduction	23.01
B. Civil Law Confrontations with the Trust	23.03
C. Increasing Use of the Offshore Trust in Civil Law Countries	23.14
D. The Hague Convention and Offshore Provisions on Recognition of the Trust	23.18
E. The Trust versus the Foundation	23.21
F. The Trust as a Corporation—Rejecting Contractual Concepts	23.32
G. Explicit Recognition as a Trust	23.40
H. Conclusion	23.49

24. Rights to Succession—Forced Heirs and the Offshore Trust	*	
A. Introduction—Addressing Mandatory Succession	24.01	
B. Anti-forced Heirship Provisions to Resolve Conflicts	24.12	
C. US Decisions on Forced Heirship Policies	24.19	
D. Other Common Law Decisions on Forced Heirship	24.27	
E. The Hague Convention and Forced Heirship	24.31	
F. Public Policy and Forced Heirship	24.36	
G. Consideration of Trust Interests in Maintenance and Spousal Awards	24.43	
H. Forced Heirship Provisions do not Override Trustees' Discretion	24.46	p
I. Validity of Hostile Beneficiaries Clauses	24.52	
J. Forced Heirship and Disclosure	24.57	
K. Conclusion	24.58	
25. Capacity to Create the Offshore Trust and Initial Transfers of Assets	→	
A. Introduction—The Importance of Preliminary Questions	25.01	
B. Offshore Aims in Relation to Preliminary Issues	25.05	
C. Validity of the Transfer—Alienation of the Property	25.07	
D. Capacity to Create the Trust—The General Question	25-13	
E. Capacity and Forced Heirship under the Hague Convention	25.18	
F. Offshore Legislative Approach to Potential Defects of Capacity	25.26	
G. Capacity of Persons from Civil Law Countries	25.39	
H. Whether Offshore Trust Law Efficient in Precluding Foreign Onshore Law	25.47	
I. Responding to Approaches which Confuse Capacity with Other Questions	25.60	
26. The Non-Enforcement of Foreign Judgments under Offshore Trust Law and Restraint Orders		
A. Introduction—Last Defence—Special Laws Prohibiting Enforcement	26.01	
B. Traditional Rules on Enforcement	26.10	

Contents

C. Other Routes to Non-Enforcement—Public Policy, Comity, and beyond	26.27
D. The Rule on Non-Enforcement of Foreign Revenue, Penal, and Public Penal Law	26.48
E. Enforcement and Variation Powers and the Offshore Trust	26.56
F. Obtaining Restraint Orders against Offshore Trusts	26.89
<i>Bibliography</i>	647
<i>Index</i>	651