

The Handbook of Experimental Economics

*John H. Kagel and
Alvin E. Roth*
Editors

PRINCETON UNIVERSITY PRESS

PRINCETON NEW JERSEY

Contents

Preface

List of Contributors

1. Introduction to Experimental Economics

Alvin E. Roth

I. A Brief History of Experimental Economics

A. Early Experiments: 1930-1960

- 1. Individual Choice and the Wallis-Friedman Critique*
- 2. Game-Theoretic Hypotheses*
- 3. Industrial Organization*

B. The 1960s to the Present

II. The Uses of Experimentation

III. Some Series of Experiments

A. Prisoners' Dilemmas and Public Goods

1. The Prisoner's Dilemma

- a. Experiments versus Simulations: A Methodological Digression

2. The Free-Rider Problem in Public Goods Provision

B. Coordination

Organization of topics:

- 1. Coordination and coordination failure*
- 2. Learning and adaptation*

C. Bargaining Behavior

Organization of topics:

- 1. Nash's model of bargaining*
- 2. Controlling for unobserved risk posture: binary lottery payoffs*
- 3. Information in bargaining*
- 4. Risk aversion in bargaining*

D. Market Organization and Competitive Equilibrium

- 1. Repeated Double Auctions with Stationary Parameters*
- 2. Some Policy-Oriented Comparisons of Market Rules*
- 3. Information Aggregation: Markets as Forecasters*

E. Auction Markets and Disequilibrium Behavior

- 1. The Winner's Curse*
- 2. Some Other Auction Results*

- a. Controlling Incentives: A Methodological Digression

| | |
|--|------------|
| F. Individual Choice Behavior | 67 |
| 1. <i>Preference Reversals</i> | |
| a. Alternative Theoretical Directions | |
| b. Market Behavior | |
| 2. <i>Other Choice Phenomena</i> | |
| 3. <i>Why Haven't These Demonstrated Anomalies Swept Away Utility Theory?</i> | |
| 4. <i>Experimental Control of Individual Preferences</i> | |
| a. The BDM Procedure for Measuring Reservation Prices | |
| b. Controlling Preferences with Monetary Payoffs | |
| c. Controlling for Unobserved Risk Preferences with Binary Lottery Payoffs | |
| <i>(1) Preferences and Probabilities: A Historical Digression on Binary Lotteries and Related Experimental Designs</i> | |
| d. To Control or Not to Control? Costs and Benefits | |
| Notes | 86 |
| Bibliography | 98 |
| | |
| 2. Public Goods: A Survey of Experimental Research | |
| <i>John O. Ledyard</i> | <i>111</i> |
| I. Introduction | 111 |
| A. A Simple Public Goods Experiment | 112 |
| B. The Art of Experiment: Sensitivity and Control | 113 |
| C. The Language of Experiment: Mechanisms and Environments | 115 |
| D. The Range of Public Goods Environments | 118 |
| E. What Is and Is Not to Be Surveyed | 119 |
| II. Are People Selfish or Cooperative? | 121 |
| A. Bohm: Estimating Demand | 122 |
| B. Dawes et al: Social Dilemmas | 126 |
| C. Marwell et al.: The Free-Rider Problem | 130 |
| D. Economists Begin to React | 134 |
| E. Isaac et al.: Systematic Study by Economists | 137 |
| III. What Improves Cooperation? | 141 |
| A. Thresholds and Provision Points | 144 |
| B. Experience, Repetition, and Learning | 146 |
| C. Strong Effects | 149 |
| 1. <i>Marginal Payoffs and Rebates</i> | |
| 2. <i>Numbers</i> | |
| 3. <i>Communication</i> | |
| D. Weak Effects | 158 |
| 1. <i>Environment</i> | |
| 2. <i>Systemic</i> | |
| 3. <i>Institutional</i> | |
| E. Unknown Effects | 167 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| IV. Final Thoughts | 169 |
| Appendix | 174 |
| Notes | 175 |
| Bibliography | 181 |
| | |
| 3. Coordination Problems | |
| <i>Jack Ochs</i> | 195 |
| Introduction | 195 |
| I. Experiments Using Overlapping Generations Environments | 197 |
| A. Adaptive Learning Processes and Rational Expectations Equilibria | 197 |
| B. The Path of Prices When the Rate of Growth of the Money Stock Is Zero | 199 |
| C. Price Inflation with a Growing Money Stock | 201 |
| D. Sunspots | 205 |
| II. Coordination Games with Pareto Ranked Equilibria | 209 |
| A. Payoff Dominance, Security and Historical Precedent | 209 |
| B. The Relevance of Dominated Strategies | 218 |
| C. Influencing Equilibrium Selection | 222 |
| III. Experiments in Decentralized Matching Environments: Games with Multiple Optimal Equilibria | 233 |
| IV. Concluding Remarks | 244 |
| Notes | 246 |
| Bibliography | 249 |
| | |
| 4. Bargaining Experiments | |
| <i>Alvin E. Roth</i> | 253 |
| I. Agreements | 254 |
| A. Unstructured Bargaining Experiments | 255 |
| B. Sequential Bargaining Experiments | 256 |
| 1. <i>An Initial Exchange of Views</i> | |
| 2. <i>A Larger Experimental Design</i> | |
| 3. <i>Investigating Observed Regularities</i> | |
| a. Are Players "Trying to Be Fair"? | |
| 4. <i>Pursuing Anomalies</i> | |
| a. Distinguishing between Alternative Hypotheses | |
| b. A Cross-Cultural Experiment | |
| 5. <i>Learning and the Role of Experience</i> | |
| n. Disagreements and Delays | 292 |
| A. The Frequency of Disagreements and Delays | 292 |
| B. Anonymous versus Face-to-Face Bargaining | 294 |
| 1. <i>Two Hypotheses</i> | |

| | |
|---|------------|
| a. The Uncontrolled Social Utility Hypothesis | |
| b. The Communication Hypothesis | |
| 2. <i>A New Experiment</i> | |
| 3. <i>Some Further Experiments</i> | |
| 4. <i>Recapitulation of the Methodological Issues</i> | |
| C. Tests of Hypotheses about the Causes of Disagreements and Costly Delays | 304 |
| 1. <i>Nonstrategic Models</i> | |
| 2. <i>Strategic Models</i> | |
| a. Complete Information Models | |
| b. Incomplete Information Models | |
| c. A Digression on the Strategy Method | |
| D. Deadlines | 323 |
| III. Concluding Remarks | 327 |
| Notes | 331 |
| Bibliography | 342 |
| | |
| 5. Industrial Organization: A Survey of Laboratory Research | |
| <i>Charles A. Holt</i> | 349 |
| I. Overview | 349 |
| II. Beginnings | 350 |
| III. The Relevance of Experiments to the Study of IO | 352 |
| A. Experiments That Bvaluate Behavioral Assumptions | 352 |
| B. Tests for Sensitivity to Violations of Structural Assumptions | 354 |
| C. Searching for Empirical Regularities | 354 |
| IV. Design and Procedural Issues | 355 |
| A. Instructions | 355 |
| B. Design Considerations | 358 |
| V. Trading Institutions | 360 |
| A. Posted Prices | 361 |
| B. Uniform Prices | 365 |
| C. One-Sided Sequential Auctions | 367 |
| D. Double Auctions | 368 |
| E. Decentralized Negotiations | 373 |
| F. Discounting | 373 |
| G. Other Institutions | 374 |
| H. Disadvantages of the Cournot Quantity-Choice Institution | 375 |
| VI. Monopoly Regulation and Potential Entry | 377 |
| A. Monopoly | 377 |
| B. Decentralized Regulatory Proposals | 382 |
| C. Potential Competition as a Regulator: Market Contestability | 383 |
| D. Predatory Pricing and Antitrust Remedies | 387 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| VII. Market Structure and Market Power | 391 |
| A. Definitions of Market Power | 392 |
| B. Market Power in Double Auctions | 393 |
| C. Market Power in Posted-Offer Auctions | 396 |
| VIII. Plus Factors That Facilitate Collusion | 398 |
| A. Repetition with Different Cohorts: Experience | 401 |
| B. Multiperiod Repetition with the Same Cohort | 403 |
| C. Pure-Numbers Effects and the Ability to Punish | 406 |
| D. Communication | 409 |
| E. Contractual Provisions | 411 |
| IX. Product Differentiation and Multiple Markets | 416 |
| A. Product Quality, Asymmetric Information, and Market Failures | 417 |
| B. Spatial Competition | 419 |
| C. Vertically Related Markets | 420 |
| X. Conclusion | 421 |
| Notes | 425 |
| Bibliography | 435 |
| | |
| 6. Experimental Asset Markets: A Survey | |
| <i>Shyam Sunder</i> | 445 |
| I. Informational Efficiency of Markets | 446 |
| A. Field Data from Financial Markets | 447 |
| B. Designing Experimental Asset Markets | 447 |
| C. Dissemination of Information | 450 |
| D. Aggregation of Information | 456 |
| E. Market for Information | 461 |
| II. Futures and State-Contingent Claims | 464 |
| EQ. Bubbles and False Equilibria | 467 |
| IV. Learning and Dynamics | 475 |
| A. Adjustment Path | 475 |
| B. Variables That Transmit Information | 475 |
| C. Learning Sequences | 477 |
| D. Aggregate Uncertainty | 479 |
| E. Role of Arbitrage | 479 |
| F. Generation of Bids and Asks | 480 |
| V. Econometric Comparisons of Field and Laboratory Data | 481 |
| A. Variance Bound Tests | 481 |
| B. Arbitrage Relationships | 482 |
| VI. Investment and Public Policy | 484 |
| A. Trading Suspensions and Price Change Limits | 484 |
| B. Double Auction versus Call Market | 485 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| C. Specialist Privileges and Book Display | 486 |
| D. Control of Speculative Bubbles | 486 |
| E. Bid-Ask Spread | 490 |
| F. Off-Floor and Block Trading | 490 |
| VII. Laboratory Modeling of Asset Markets | 491 |
| VIII. Concluding Remarks | 493 |
| Notes | 494 |
| Bibliography | 495 |
| | |
| Auctions: A Survey of Experimental Research | |
| <i>John H. Kagel</i> | 501 |
| Introduction | 501 |
| I. The Symmetric Independent Private-Values Model | 503 |
| A. Experimental Procedures | 504 |
| B. Tests of the Revenue-Equivalence Theorem | 505 |
| 1. <i>Tests of the Strategic Equivalence of First-Price and Dutch Auctions</i> | |
| 2. <i>Tests of the Strategic Equivalence of Second-Price and English Auctions</i> | |
| C. Effects of Varying and Uncertain Numbers of Bidders | 514 |
| 1. <i>Effects of Changing Numbers of Bidders</i> | |
| 2. <i>Uncertainty Regarding the Number of Bidders</i> | |
| D. Auctions with Affiliated Private Values | 517 |
| E. Effects of Price Information in Private Value Auctions | 520 |
| F. Learning, Adjustment Processes, and Cash Balance Effects in First-Price Private Value Auctions | 521 |
| G. Risk Aversion, CRRA, the Flat Maximum Critique, and the Binary Lottery Procedure for Controlling Risk Preferences | 523 |
| 1. <i>Risk Aversion and CRRAM As Applied to Single Unit First-Price Auctions</i> | |
| 2. <i>The Flat Maximum Critique</i> | |
| 3. <i>Risk Aversion and Overbidding in Related Environments</i> | |
| 4. <i>Using the Binary Lottery Procedure to Control for Risk Aversion</i> | |
| II. Common Value Auctions | 536 |
| A. The Winner's Curse in Sealed Bid Common Value Auctions | 537 |
| 1. <i>First-Price Sealed Bid Auctions</i> | |
| 2. <i>Limited Liability and "Safe Havens"</i> | |
| 3. <i>Second-Price Sealed Bid Auctions</i> | |
| B. More Winner's Curse: English Auctions and First-Price Auctions with Asymmetric Information | 547 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| C. The Winner's Curse in Other Market Settings | 550 |
| 1. <i>The Winner's Curse in Bilateral Bargaining Games with Asymmetric Information</i> | |
| 2. <i>The Winner's Curse in "Blind Bid" Auctions</i> | |
| 3. <i>Lemons and Ripoffs: The Winner's Curse in Markets with Quality Endogenously Determined</i> | |
| D. Learning and Adjustment Processes in Markets with a Winner's Curse | 557 |
| III. Additional Topics | 560 |
| A. Collusion | 560 |
| B. Comparing Results from Field Studies with Experiments | 564 |
| 1. <i>Direct Comparisons between Laboratory and Field Data</i> | |
| 2. <i>Differences in Structure between Laboratory and Field Auctions</i> | |
| C. Two-Sided Auctions | 569 |
| D. Other Auction Studies | 572 |
| IV. Conclusions | 572 |
| Notes | 573 |
| Bibliography | 580 |
| | |
| 8. Individual Decision Making | |
| <i>Colin Camerer</i> | 587 |
| I. Introduction | 587 |
| A. Limited Rationality and Decision Research | 588 |
| 1. <i>Why Study Errors in Decision Making?</i> | |
| B. Two Controversies: Methods and Implications | 588 |
| C. A Map and Guidebook | 589 |
| II. Judgment | 590 |
| A. Calibration | 590 |
| 1. <i>Scoring Rules</i> | |
| 2. <i>Confidence Intervals</i> | |
| B. Perception and Memory Biases | 595 |
| C. Bayesian Updating and Representativeness | 596 |
| 1. <i>Underweighting of Base Rates</i> | |
| 2. <i>Underweighting of Likelihood Information (Conservatism)</i> | |
| 3. <i>The Law of Small Numbers and Misperceptions of Randomness</i> | |
| 4. <i>Market Level Tests of Representativeness</i> | |
| D. Confirmation Bias and Obstacles to Learning | 608 |
| E. Expectations Formation | 609 |
| F. Iterated Expectations and the Curse of Knowledge | 612 |
| 1. <i>False Consensus and Hindsight Bias</i> | |
| 2. <i>Market Level Tests of Curse of Knowledge</i> | |

- G. The Illusion of Control
- H. Judgment: Summary and New Directions

III. Choice under Risk and Uncertainty

- A. Expected Utility
 - 1. *Notation and a Diagram*
 - 2. *The Axioms*
- B. Some History and Early Evidence
 - 1. *Three Controversies*
 - 2. *Initial Tests*
- C. Mounting Evidence of EU Violation (1965-1986)
 - 1. *The Allais Paradoxes*
 - 2. *Process Violations*
 - 3. *Prospect Theory*
 - 4. *Elicitation Biases*
- D. Generalizations of Expected Utility and Recent Tests
 - 1. *Predictions of Generalized EU Theories*
 - 2. *Empirical Studies Using Pairwise Choices*
 - 3. *Empirical Studies Measuring Indifference Curves*
 - 4. *Empirical Studies Fitting Functions to Individuals*
 - 5. *Cross-Species Robustness: Experiments with Animals*
 - 6. *Some Conclusions from Recent Studies*
 - 7. *Investments in Risky Assets*
- E. Subjective Expected Utility
 - 1. *The Ellsberg Paradox*
 - 2. *Conceptions of Ambiguity*
 - 3. *Empirical Tests*
 - 4. *Formal Models*
 - 5. *Applications to Economics*
- F. Choice over Time
- G. Process Theories and Tests
- H. Description Invariance
 - 1. *Framing Effects*
 - 2. *Lottery Correlation, Regret, and Display Effects*
 - 3. *Compound Lottery Reduction*
- I. Procedure Invariance
 - 1. *New Evidence of Preference Reversal*
 - 2. *Arbitrage and Incentives*
 - 3. *Reversals and Markets*
 - 4. *Social Comparison and Reversals*
 - 5. *Some Conclusions about Preference Reversals*
- J. Endowment Effects and Buying-Selling Price Gaps
 - 1. *Market Experiments*
 - 2. *Explanations Based on Experimental Artifacts*
 - 3. *Endowment Effects: Some Psychology and Implications*

| | |
|--|------------|
| K. Search | 670 |
| 1. <i>Search for Wages and Prices</i> | |
| 2. <i>Search for Information</i> | |
| L. Choice: Summary and New Directions | 673 |
| IV. Conclusions and Research Directions | 674 |
| Notes | 676 |
| Bibliography | 683 |
| Author Index | 708 |
| Subject Index | 715 |