

Intermediated Securities

Legal Problems and Practical Issues

Edited by

Louise Gullifer and Jennifer Payne

• H A R T *
PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON
2010

Contents

<i>Foreword by Sir Roy Goode, CBE, QC</i>	v
<i>Preface</i>	vii
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xv
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xviii
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xxi
<i>Table of International Instruments</i>	xxix

1. Ownership of Securities: the Problems Caused by Intermediation

<i>Louise Gullifer</i>	<i>1</i>
I. Introduction	1
II. The Risks of Intermediation	4
A. The Risks in General	4
B. The Risk of Legal Uncertainty: Conflict of Laws Solutions	5
C. The Risk of Legal Uncertainty: Substantive Law Solutions	6
III. Pooled Accounts in the Intermediated Holding System	12
IV. The Nature of The Interest of a Holder of Intermediated Securities	16
A. Rights against the Intermediary	16
B. Protection on the Intermediary's Insolvency	18
V. Problems Arising from Pooled Accounts	22
A. The Identification Problem	22
B. The Shortfall Problem	24
VI. Protection of Good Faith Purchasers	26
VII. Taking Security over Intermediated Securities	30
VIII. Conclusion	31

2. Interests in Securities: Practical Problems and Conceptual Solutions

<i>Ben Macfarlane and Robert Stevens</i>	<i>33</i>
I. Introduction	33
II. Twelve Issues	34
A. Issue 1: What is the Nature of the Investor's Rights in Relation to the Securities?	34
B. Issue 2: Is there a Valid Trust at All?	39
C. Issue 3: What Happens if There is a Shortfall in the Assets Held by the Intermediary?	40
D. Issue 4: Can a Third Party Make a Claim to Assets in the Hands of the Intermediary?	45

Contents

E.	Issue 5: Perfection of a Security Interest	45
F.	Issue 6: The No-Look-Through Principle	46
G.	Issue 7: Upper-Tier Attachment	48
H.	Issue 8: How Should Priority Issues Be Resolved?	48
I.	Issue 9: Protection of Purchaser in Good Faith	52
J.	Issue 10: Assignments of Equitable Interests	54
K.	Issue 11: The Conflict of Laws	55
L.	Issue 12: Civilian Systems	58
III.	Conclusion	59
3.	Intermediated Securities: Issues arising on Insolvency	
	<i>Gabriel Moss, QC</i>	61
I.	Introduction	61
II.	Legal Concepts and Practical Problems	62
III.	The Nature of the Investor's Right in Intermediated Securities	65
IV.	Is There a Valid Trust At All?	66
V.	Shortfall	66
VI.	The Conflict of Laws	67
VII.	Conclusion	68
4.	Core Issues under the UNIDROIT (Geneva) Convention on Intermediated Securities: Views from the United States and Japan	
	<i>Charles W Mooney, Jr and. Hideki Kanda</i>	69
I.	Introduction	69
II.	Structure and Background	72
A.	Intermediated Securities Holding Systems	72
B.	Goals and Approach	74
C.	Significance of Relevant Legal Doctrine and Relationship to Systemic Risk	76
III.	Overview of Convention and United States and Japanese Legal Regimes	79
A.	Background on Legal Frameworks	79
B.	Dematerialisation	82
C.	Basic Attributes of Intermediated Securities	83
D.	Acquisition of Intermediated Securities	85
E.	Duties of Intermediary	87
IV.	Innocent Acquisition and Priorities	94
A.	Innocent Acquisition of Intermediated Securities ('Good Faith Purchase')	95
B.	Priority Rules	108
V.	Relationship of Convention to Insolvency Law	119
A.	Background	119
B.	Convention Interests in an Insolvency Proceeding: In General	120

Contents

C.	Convention Interests in the Relevant Intermediary's Insolvency Proceeding	122
D.	Special Provisions for Collateral Transactions	127
VI.	Conclusion	129
5.	The Legal Nature of Securities: Inspirations from Comparative Law	
	<i>Eva Micheler</i>	131
I.	Introduction	131
A.	Property Rights in Intermediated Securities	132
B.	Quasi-Negotiability	134
II.	The Legal Nature of Securities in German and Austrian Law	135
A.	Modern German Theory	135
B.	Earlier Theory: Securities as Intangibles	136
C.	Securities as Assets of their own Kind	140
D.	Savigny's Contribution	141
III.	The Legal Nature of Securities in English Law	143
IV.	The Characteristics of Securities	144
V.	Securities as Circulating Rights	146
VI.	Conclusion	148
6.	Reuse of Financial Collateral Revisited	
	<i>Erica Johanssen</i>	151
I.	Introduction	151
II.	The Financial Collateral Directive	152
III.	Financial Collateral Arrangement Regulations	152
IV.	Geneva Securities Convention on Substantive Rules for Intermediated Securities	159
V.	Protective Mechanisms Developed in the Financial Markets	160
VI.	Protection of Account Holders' Rights: Legislative Recommendations	162
VII.	Conclusion	164
7.	Taking Security over Intermediated Securities: Chapter V of the UNIDROIT (Geneva) Convention on Intermediated Securities	
	<i>Antony Zacaroli, QC</i>	167
I.	Introduction	167
II.	The Convention and the EC Directive	168
A.	Relaxation of Aspects of Insolvency Law	171
B.	Formal Validity and Perfection of Security	173
III.	Rights of Withdrawal and Substitution and the Fixed/Floating Charge Debate	174
IV.	Floating Charges and the EC Directive	180
V.	Floating Charges and the Convention	183
A.	The Concept of 'Control' and the Convention	183

Contents

B.	Floating Charges under English Law and Articles 11 and 12 of the Convention	184
8.	Intermediated Securities and the Right to Vote in the UK:	
	<i>Jennifer Payne</i>	187
I.	Introduction	187
II.	Corporate Governance in UK Public Companies	188
III.	Why might shares be held through an intermediary?	193
IV.	Enfranchising Indirect Investors Who May Want to Have a Corporate Governance Role	195
A.	The Beneficiary Instructs the Intermediary to Vote on his Behalf	197
B.	The Intermediary Delegates to the Beneficiary the Rights Attached to the Shares	201
V.	Indirect Investors Who Hold Via Institutional Investors	207
VI.	Assessment of The UK System	212
VII.	Conclusion	216
9.	Intermediated Securities: The Choice of a Choice of Law Rule:	
	<i>Maisie Ooi</i>	219
I.	Introduction	219
II.	The Choice of Law Problem	220
III.	The EU Directives	221
IV.	The Hague Securities Convention	222
V.	The Hague Securities Convention and EU Choice of Law Rules Compared	223
VI.	Concerns About the Hague Securities Convention's Choice of Law Rule	225
VII.	Substantive law solution to the choice of law problem?	229
VIII.	Choice of Law Choices	230
A.	The Law of the System	231
B.	The Law Determined by Reference to the Transferor's Intermediary	236
IX.	Comparison of Choice of Law Treatments	238
A.	The Hague Securities Convention Rule	239
B.	The EU Rule	241
C.	The Law of the System	242
D.	The Law Determined by Reference to the Transferor's Intermediary	242
X.	Conclusion	243

Contents

10. Remarks on the development of the UNIDROIT (Geneva) Convention on Intermediated Securities and its future:	
<i>Herbert Kronke</i>	245
I. Introduction	245
II. Functional Approach	246
III. Scope of the Instrument	247
IV. Implementation	248
11. Views from Europe:	
<i>Habib Motani, Karin Wallin-Norman, Teun Struycken</i>	253
Habib Motani: United Kingdom	253
Karin Wallin-Norman: Sweden	254
Teun Struycken: Netherlands	255
Appendix: UNIDROIT Convention on Substantive Rules for Intermediated Securities: the Geneva Securities Convention 2009	259
<i>Index</i>	285